

# Rubrics: Tools for Learning and Assessment



STATE ASSESSMENT MEETING  
JUNE 11, 2010  
VALENCIA COMMUNITY COLLEGE  
ORLANDO, FLORIDA

PATRICK NELLIS  
MIAMI DADE COLLEGE  
[PNELLIS@MDC.EDU](mailto:PNELLIS@MDC.EDU)

# Etymology, or *That's Where it Came From*



# Vehicle Ratings – Kelly Blue Book



## **Excellent**

"Excellent" condition means that the vehicle looks new, is in excellent mechanical condition and needs no reconditioning. This vehicle has never had any paint or body work and is free of rust. The vehicle has a clean title history and will pass a smog and safety inspection. The engine compartment is clean, with no fluid leaks and is free of any wear or visible defects. The vehicle also has complete and verifiable service records. Less than 5% of all used vehicles fall into this category.

## **Good**

"Good" condition means that the vehicle is free of any major defects. This vehicle has a clean title history, the paint, body and interior have only minor (if any) blemishes, and there are no major mechanical problems. There should be little or no rust on this vehicle. The tires match and have substantial tread wear left. A "good" vehicle will need some reconditioning to be sold at retail. Most consumer owned vehicles fall into this category.

## **Fair**

"Fair" condition means that the vehicle has some mechanical or cosmetic defects and needs servicing but is still in reasonable running condition. This vehicle has a clean title history, the paint, body and/or interior need work performed by a professional. The tires may need to be replaced. There may be some repairable rust damage.

## **Poor**

"Poor" condition means that the vehicle has severe mechanical and/or cosmetic defects and is in poor running condition. The vehicle may have problems that cannot be readily fixed such as a damaged frame or a rusted-through body. A vehicle with a branded title (salvage, flood, etc.) or unsubstantiated mileage is considered "poor."

# What is a Rubric?



- **A scoring scale to measure student performance**
- **Consists of criteria**
- **Identifies levels of achievement for each criterion**
- **May provide descriptors for each level**
- **Guides the assessment of student work**

# Why Use a Rubric?



- **Articulate the standards for student performance**
  - To students
  - To colleagues
- **Provide feedback to students**
  - Timely
  - Consistent
  - Detailed
- **Provide feedback to teachers**
  - Patterns in performance
  - Make changes in teaching

# Types of Rubrics

Jon Mueller



- An **analytic rubric** contains levels of performance for each criterion so the teacher can assess student performance on each criterion.
- A **holistic rubric** assigns a total level of performance by assessing performance across multiple criteria as a whole. It does not list separate levels of performance for each criterion.

# Levels of Assessment



- **Classroom Level**
  - Rubrics for assignments
  - Rubrics for discussion/participation/behaviors
- **Discipline/Program level**
  - Rubrics to judge capstone projects
  - Rubrics for portfolios
  - Rubrics for assessment tasks
- **Institutional Level**
  - Rubrics for assessment tasks/performances

# PTA = Rubric

Walvoord & Anderson



- **Primary Trait Analysis for Assignments**
- **Explicit**
- **Criterion-referenced**
- **Identify the traits that count in evaluation of the assignment**
- **Create a scale (from 2-5 points, your choice) of descriptive statements for these traits**



# PTA = Rubric



**Begin with the traits (elements)**

- **Imagine the best student work, write down those qualities**
- **Imagine the worst student work, write down those qualities**
- **Now work on the middle of your scale**

# Formats



- **A scoring guide for students/ professors in list form**
- **An analytical rubric in a chart**

Example Rubric: Integrated Economics and Government course required students to develop a national economic program presented as a congressional bill. (Huba and Freed, 2000)

**Levels of Achievement**

**Criteria or Elements or Primary Traits for Evaluation**

Criteria	Exemplary 5-6	Proficient 3-4	Acceptable 1-2	Unacceptable 0
Significance of Economic Problem	Your bill addresses a recognized economic problem with macro...	Your bill addresses a recognized economic problem, but it may be...	Your bill addresses an apparent economic problem but it is not of sufficient...	Your bill may have economic content, but it does not address a recognized or apparent...
Knowledge of procedures for Introducing a Bill	Your bill conforms to correct procedures for writing and	Your bill conforms... with only a few minor omissions or commissions	Your bill is presented with several errors in procedure...	You have not made an effort to follow accepted procedure for writing or

**Commentary to Describe Features at Each Level**

# Reading Quiz Rubric



## **Score of 3 points**

An answer is **clear** when:

- It states a definition of the concept/problem/issue.
- It elaborates on the meaning of the statement.
- It gives concrete examples.

and the answer is also **relevant** and **accurate**.

## **Score of 2 points**

Answer is clear (see above) but not as relevant in choice of example or as accurate in elaboration.

## **Score of 1 point**

Answer merely states a definition of the concept/problem/issue.

## **Score of 0 points**

Answer says nothing clearly, accurately, or with relevance.

# Rubrics Improve Student Learning

– Huba and Freed (2000)



- **Reveal to students the standards of our disciplines**
- **Inform students about the qualities that compose good and poor work**
- **Rubrics can be used to involve students in setting standards or criteria**
- **A variety of individuals can use a rubric to give feedback to students**

# Rubrics Improve Evaluation

– Huba and Freed (2000)



- **Minimizes differences in ratings**
- **Focuses everyone on the same set of standards**
- **Provides a mechanism for formative feedback**
- **Makes peer evaluation more efficient**
- **Course – Program – Institutional levels**

# Rubrics Improve Teaching



Trait	Before	After	P Values*
Title	2.95	3.22	.24
Introduction	3.18	3.64	.14
Scientific Format	3.09	3.32	.31
Methods and Materials	3.00	3.55	.14
Non-Experimental Info	3.18	3.50	.24
Designing the Experiment	2.68	3.32	.07
Defining Operationally	2.68	3.50	.01
Controlling Variables	2.73	3.18	.10
Collecting Data	2.86	3.36	.14
Interpreting Data	2.90	3.59	.03
Overall	2.93	3.42	.09

Study by Virginia Anderson, rubrics used by external evaluators; “after” reflects changes made to instruction.

# Summary



- Rubrics are a versatile assessment tool
- Design depends on audience and purpose
- Rubrics focus attention on student learning
- Design is a faculty and curriculum development process that produces many good results



# Resources



- **Authentic Assessment Toolbox:** <http://jonathan.mueller.faculty.noctrl.edu/toolbox/>
- *This site provides an online tutorial with recommendations for articulating standards, developing assignments, and designing rubrics to assess student work.*
- **RubiStar:** <http://rubistar.4teachers.org/index.php>
- *At this site, you may create a rubric online and print it out for use in your class, or open up and modify one of the example rubrics available at the site. If you register (for free), you may save your rubrics online for later use.*
- **RCampus:** <http://www.rcampus.com/>
- *This site contains several online resources for faculty members, including rubrics. For a list of rubrics for courses in psychology, visit <http://www.rcampus.com/indexrubric.cfm>*
- **TLT Teaching, Learning and Technology Group, [tltgroup.org](http://tltgroup.org)**
- *These sites are the remains of online workshops offered by TLT Group. They have many interesting web links embedded, well worth viewing.*
- <http://www.tltgroup.org/resources/flashlight/rubrics.htm>
- <http://tltgroup.org/resources/Rubrics.htm>
- **AAC&U**
- *The VALUE rubrics are available on this site. These are “transdisciplinary” rubrics on most of the topics considered part of general education in the liberal arts.*
- [https://www.aacu.org/value/rubrics/index\\_p.cfm?CFID=28596168&CFTOKEN=61533376](https://www.aacu.org/value/rubrics/index_p.cfm?CFID=28596168&CFTOKEN=61533376)
- **Winona State University (Susan Hatfield)**
- *A collection of interesting rubrics from across disciplines and around the nation.*
- <http://course1.winona.edu/shatfield/air/rubrics.htm>
- **Three excellent print resources:**
- Effective Grading. Walvoord, B.E., and V. J. Anderson. (San Francisco: Jossey Bass, 1998)
- Learner-Centered Assessment on College Campuses. Huba, M.E. , and J.E. Freed. (Boston: Allyn & Bacon, 2000)
- Introduction to Rubrics. Stevens, D.D. and A.J. Levi. (Sterling, Virginia: Stylus, 2005).